Classroom Assimilation:
The Triumph and Tragedy of the Indian Boarding Schools

Dana Floberg
Junior Division
Historical Paper
“...The white man had concluded that the only way to save Indians was to destroy them, that the last great Indian war should be waged against children. They were coming for the children.” – David Wallace Adams

In the late 1870’s, one of the most frequently discussed topics was the disastrous condition of Native American life, commonly called the “Indian Problem.” Confident in their belief in manifest destiny, white Americans were persistent in expanding to the west and consequently disturbing the Indians. Violence broke out in varying degrees, and though it had temporarily ceased, both whites and Indians were restless. The Indians were living on tiny reservations, unable to continue their way of life without buffalo and other resources that the white Americans had made scarce. They depended wholly on the American government, which doled out assistance begrudgingly. There was constant tension, and harsh judgments were made. One government official was quoted as saying, “The way I see it, we have to either butcher them, or civilize them” (Cooper 21). There can be no doubt that an introduction to Euro-American society was necessary for the Indian’s survival, but due to the assimilation policy that America’s government adopted, the Indian people became subjected to the tragedies of cultural genocide. This drastically changed who the Indians were and severely damaged their cultural integrity.

When Captain Richard Henry Pratt made his proposal in 1879 to start an off-reservation Indian Boarding School, he believed he was offering a humane solution to the Indian Problem. An old war hero with some experience in educating Indian prisoners at Fort Marion and Hampton school, he wished to continue his experiment. He described how, using schools, he would “give the Indian youth the English language, education,
and industries that it is imperative they have in preparation for citizenship” (Pratt 216). Pratt believed that the Indians should be given the same treatment as immigrants. He wished to teach them how to operate in “civilized society,” and he summed up this idea with the phrase, “Kill the Indian, Save the Man” (Churchill 14).

The government saw Pratt’s idea as a useful alternative to the expensive warfare necessary to “butcher” the Indians, and turned a deserted military barracks in Pennsylvania into Carlisle Indian Industrial School, where Pratt was appointed superintendent. Reform groups such as the “Indians Rights Association” and “Friends of the Indian” agreed wholeheartedly with Pratt’s educational vision (No Author, clarke.cmich.edu). They thought the Indians as capable as the whites, but they had no concept of value for the Indian ways, and believed that by supporting the government in setting up boarding schools across the country, they were helping the Indians. The intention was that after a while these boarding schools would cease to be necessary and Indian children would meld into the public school system, completing the assimilation process.

It was impossible for the Indians to continue their lives the way they always had. They were stuck on tiny, inadequate reservations with severely limited supplies and resources. Conflict between the Indians and whites was constant. A full out war would be long and difficult, but the whites were by far the greater power, and their eventual triumph would be inevitable.

First Captain Pratt went to the tribes and simply asked them to send their children to be educated. He said the Government had adopted a new policy with the Indians, that they were going to teach them English and other white “qualities.” He described how it
would be much better if they learned the white man’s way, that it would make their children as competent as white children (Pratt 21).

Most Indian tribes were upset by the idea; they believed that white people were all thieves and liars, and they didn’t want their children to learn to be that way. Pratt tried to convince them that if their children understood the white language and manners, they could help their tribes be wiser in confrontations with the white people. Many tribes finally agreed to send children, indeed, some were eager to go. Their life on the reservations was hard, and some were attracted to the idea of going away to school. Other tribes, however, remained adamantly against it. When Indians resisted, officials threatened, deceived, withheld food rations, and used physical force to take as many children as possible. The Indian population was horrified.

Once they had been captured, the children were sent to a boarding school far away from their reservation, intending to help sever relationships with friends and family. It was a frightening experience, as former student Patricia Waconda indicates, “We got off the bus in this strange, strange place, and they didn’t even tell us we was going to have to stay, and we thought we were going to stay just for the night, you know, so we went in, and I laugh now but at the time it was so scary…” (Archuleta 26)

Upon their arrival, they underwent a huge transformation. Indian children were scrubbed down using soap and other, stronger cleaning chemicals. Tribal clothes were replaced with stiff, unfamiliar uniforms, and hair was cut short. The latter was particularly tragic for the Indian youth, because in many Indian cultures, cutting hair was a sign of loss and mourning. The children would have been almost unrecognizable to the closest of friends. (Huangyi, www.ustrek.org)
They were also given Christian names, though methods for name giving varied from school to school. Some schools had the children pick a name from a list on a blackboard, whereas others were randomly assigned. Last names were usually rough English translations of the child’s father’s name (Terry, etext.lib.virginia.edu). Once names were picked, they were sewn onto little tags that were attached to the child’s clothing and bedding. One former student tells of himself and siblings: “Our name isn’t supposed to be Jones but Chonka, or something like that and the teachers couldn’t say it right so they just give us Jones” (Archuleta 28). Everything possible was done to destroy connections with the children’s “savage past.”

Students were not allowed to speak their native tongue, and were forced to communicate in sign language until they learned English. A student named John Rogers remembers, “It was very difficult for me at first, for students at the school were not allowed to speak the language of the Indian. At the time I understood nothing else” (Archuleta 24). Children who were caught “talking Indian” were punished.

Even after the first few days at school, life was difficult. As soon as the children mastered rudimentary English, half the day was assigned to a trade: housekeeping and domestic arts for the girls, and farming and labor for the boys. Academic instruction was designed to give students the equivalent of a 6th grade education and to promote Christianity. The curriculum varied widely from school to school, becoming somewhat uniform in 1898 when Estelle Reel, newly appointed National Superintendent of Indian Boarding Schools, wrote a course of study emphasizing manual labor and “making a willing worker” (Reel 5). They were taught that everything about the Indian ways was bad, as shown in this short essay written by an Indian student:
“The white people they are civilized; they have everything and go to school, too. They learn how to read and write so they can read newspaper. The yellow people they half civilized, some of them know to read and write, and some know how to take care of themself. The red people they big savages; they don’t know nothing.” (Adams 148)

The schools had strict schedules that ensured the students never had a moment to themselves. It was generally believed that the Indians were idle and lazy, and did not have a correct sense of the value of time. The boarding schools strove to correct this (Landis, home.epix.net).

The smallest disobedience would frequently result in harsh punishment. If a student was caught speaking their native tongue, they might have their mouth washed out with lye soap. Other rule violations could result in extra chores or being locked up in a guardhouse with only bread and water for up to a week, depending on their crime (Archuleta 42).

Another problem was rebellion. Student Curtis Thorpe Carr from Chilocco school recalls, “We used to deliberately do things just to show them that we could do it and get away with it…I happened to be one that…couldn’t stand somebody telling me what to do every minute of the day or night…and I was gonna rebel come hell or high water” (Archuleta 47). Many students tried to run away from the schools and home to their reservations, but it was a lost cause. They were usually caught, if they didn’t die, and the spare few who managed to make it home were just sent back to their schools to face severe punishment. An Indian mother of three said, when sending her children off to Haskell Institute, “If you run away from school, you’ll go back faster than you came home” (Horne 31).
Each school had a cemetery. Students who could not adjust would often become weak from homesickness, making them more susceptible to diseases such as tuberculosis and influenza. Bad living conditions did not help their situation, and though the specific numbers are uncertain, it is estimated that the boarding schools had a mortality rate of somewhere between 42% and 47% (Churchill 34). Such tragic events made the boarding schools even more unpopular as parents became worried for their children.

The misery that students experienced at the schools was the result of a serious crime: cultural genocide. The main focus of the boarding schools was to turn the Indians into white civilians, to rid them of their barbaric past, and consequently their way of life. Though the American people did not realize what they were doing at the time, it was made clear later on in the 1948 Convention on Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide. Here, genocide is defined as committing or attempting to commit any of these five acts: Killing members of the group, causing serious bodily or mental harm to members of the group, deliberately inflicting on the group conditions of life calculated to bring about its physical destruction in whole or in part, imposing measures intended to prevent births within the group, and forcibly transferring children of the group to another group (Churchill 8). The Indian boarding schools were responsible for committing at least two of the acts listed above, declaring beyond a shadow of a doubt that they were a cultural genocide.

In spite of these tragic circumstances, however, the Indian youth tried to make the most of it. Esther Burnett Horne describes how even though life could be difficult, she and her fellow classmates still found ways to be happy. She recalls, “Many of us were mature beyond our years but still retained the ability to play and joke and tease” (Horne
Soon many of the children were taking solace in football, baseball, and band. Football, especially, became a great motivation for the Indians, and helped to show the rest of the world that the Indians were just as capable as whites. Carlisle’s team became famous after defeating some of the strongest football teams in the league (Pratt 316). The schools also became more humane through the years, changing in little ways, like requiring parent permission to send a student to school.

The boarding schools had rather mixed results. After graduation, some of the girls stayed as teachers. Men tried to become tradesman and women tried to find work as servants or housemaids, but their skills were unwanted. A few of them went back to their reservations and rejected white culture entirely, while most attempted to make a meager living for themselves, never fully accepted in either society. Still others had worse outcomes, after being told for so long that everything they knew was bad, “Some became so confused and depressed that they eventually turned to alcohol and began a long, multi-generational cycle of self-destruction that the reservations contend with even today,” (Smith, Email Interview). Some schools made a point to follow up with graduated students, but they were more focused on seeing how the graduates influenced other Indian people around them as opposed to the quality of their lifestyle (Ludlow 10).

There are stories of triumph as well, though. Jim Thorpe, who went to Carlisle, became a famous athlete and Olympic medalist. Susan la Flesche became the first Indian physician and one of the first females in that profession. Artist Fred Kapotie’s artwork sold in both Europe and America. Several graduates also had happy and successful lives without becoming rich or famous. One such woman, Ruthie Blalock
Jones, states in relation to the boarding schools: “They were started to stamp out the Indian from the Indian, you know, make us all into white people, and you know, it didn’t work. Actually…it was the exact opposite: It made us stronger as Indian people. It made us more aware of and more proud of who we were” (Archuleta Inside Flap).

Throughout the early 1930s, the boarding schools began to shut down. This was in response to a survey conducted in 1928 by the Institute of Government Research called the Meriam Report, which opened the eyes of the public to the problems in the boarding schools. It reads, “The survey staff finds itself obliged to say frankly and unequivocally that the provisions for the care of the Indian children in boarding schools are grossly inadequate” (Meriam 2). The report details deficiencies in diet, medical service, dormitory conditions, discipline, and low standard teachers and employees. A few schools, such as Chemawa in Salem, Oregon, underwent serious changes and remain in operation today.

The boarding schools were “really a black mark on the U.S.’s history, and people need to understand that there are still people suffering from it today,” as states superintendent of Riverside Indian School Don Sims (Sims Phone Interview). The Indians fought desperately for who they were, but it was just not enough to preserve much more than the bones of their once magnificent culture. This mindset of assimilation through schooling was not unique to America, but can be found throughout history. It resounds quite strongly with Australia, 1931, when white settlers attempted to place aboriginal children in boarding schools (Pilkington 64).
In present times, Indians are making an effort to bring back their cultures. Modern-day Indian schools are teaching native languages, and emphasizing learning their ancestor’s ways through tribal clubs and celebrations (Sims Phone Interview). They take care to remember the trials of the boarding schools, and continue to strive for Indian rights.

In theory, an educational system for Indian children in the 1870s was a wonderful way to end the tragic bloodshed between the two races. In practice, it was a cultural genocide. Though the few successful boarding school graduates and the resurgence of Indian culture are considerable triumphs, they still can never completely atone for the heart wrenching tragedies imposed upon the Indian people.

Dana Floberg
Works Cited
Primary Sources


This book had a decent amount of background information, but was most useful in its large collection of photographs, poems and quotes. It was because of this collection of first hand information that I have labeled it as a primary source.


Assimilation’s Agent was an invaluable primary source. It provided many quotes and a fresh point of view, as well as very detailed descriptions of the boarding school experience.


http://www.ilstu.edu/~keciani/Hisotry_264.htm

This page contained a picture of a group of female Indian students in sewing class. It was very helpful to get a better feel for the atmosphere of an average Indian classroom.

http://english.uiowa.edu/specialties/19thUS.html

This picture shows a divine figure representing American progress and “enlightenment” moving westward with settlers and causing the Indians and wild beasts to flee. It depicts very clearly the attitude towards the west cultivated by the idea of manifest destiny.


This book provided an invaluable point of view, a deeper look into the boarding schools from the point of both teachers and students. It was very detailed and provided several quotes.


http://www.ustrek.org/odssey/semester1/010601/010601irenecarlisle.htm

From this article, I found a picture of Tom Toledo, before and after his boarding school experience. This was very helpful and really demonstrated the serious effect the schools had on the Indian children.

This site had tons of detailed information about life, curriculum, and primary sources from the Carlisle Industrial School in Pennsylvania. This was an important reference and it provided several quotes.

Ludlow, Helen Wilhelmina. Ten Years' Work for Indians at the Hampton Normal and Agricultural Institute, at Hampton, Virginia. Hampton, VA: Hampton Normal and Agricultural Institute, 1889.

The part of this document I was most particularly concerned about was a report on returned students of Hampton, by Cora M. Folsom. It describes in great detail the way several graduated students live their lives, focusing mostly on the influence they have on other Indians to encourage them to be civilized.

Pratt, Richard Henry. Battlefield & Classroom: Four Decades with the American Indian

New Haven: Yale University Press, 1964

This book was Captain Richard Pratt’s autobiography, and is extremely detailed. It was helpful and accurate in pointing how the boarding schools helped the Indians compel respect from white Americans. It provided many quotes.


This was a highly interesting source. Estelle Reel became National Superintendent of Indian Boarding Schools in 1898, and her course of study
promoted teaching the Indian children the virtues of manual labor, since she believed the Indians were in general better for that than a profession.


In this book, Luther Standing Bear, a Sioux chief son, talks of his childhood among his people. Though he did go to a boarding school, he does not mention it in this book, so I used it as a resource to better understand the Indian culture and what had been lost through the schools.


This source was interesting because it described how many boarding school officials disregarded the renaming system they were told to enforce. It also revealed that many officials didn’t think highly of the Indians own customs, including their system of naming.


This was a government report of how many of the Indian boarding schools were closed due to inefficiency. It was interesting to read about how people began to realize that perhaps the boarding schools were not a good idea and helped formulate a more complete image of the boarding school experience.

This document was printed in response to an uproar about whether or not Indian children should be provided with Bibles written in their native language. It helped to show me some of the motivations behind the banning of the Indian tongue.


This government document was a report on the condition of Native American in the U.S., including the boarding schools. It includes several pages of detailed information about the deficiencies of the boarding schools. The Meriam Report also sparked the desire to shut down the boarding schools in the 1930’s.


In this document I found a brief overview of the rules of teaching religion in government boarding schools. It dealt mostly with how much time should be dedicated to religion, and how to decide with denomination a child would learn.

This publication detailed several people’s opinions on several aspects of the boarding schools. The part that I found most helpful was a paper that one of the people shared written by an Indian boy about the Indian ways. It was interesting to see, in detail, the culture that was at stake.

This document was an overview of the rules and duties for each official in the boarding school system, detailing the goals for the schools and the specific authority that each official had. It was very useful in helping me to understand more about the boarding school system, as well as the motivation to start them.

United States. *Performance of Bureau of Indian Affairs Off-Reservation Boarding Schools: Hearing Before the Committee on Indian Affairs, United States Senate, One Hundred Third Congress, Second Session, on Oversight Hearing to Review the Performance of Bureau of Indian Affairs Off-Reservation Boarding Schools.*
This book was a record of testimonies given to decide what to do about problems in modern day boarding schools. Though this did not directly relate to the issues I discussed, it helped me to see the changes that occurred in the boarding schools that were not shut down.

This book is a largely biographical collection of stories written by a Carlisle school graduate. I have listed it as a primary source because Gertrude Simmons (aka, Zitkala-Sa) describes her own impressions of the boarding schools in great detail, which gives rare insight to the Indian perspective.

**Secondary Sources**


In this book I found a great deal more information about the Indian children’s perspectives. It included several quotes and letters from children who went to boarding schools, and I found those very useful.


From this biography I found a lot of information about what prompted Captain Pratt to start the Indian School of Carlisle. This was mainly background information that I used to help put my idea of Captain Pratt into perspective.

This book not only provided a good deal of information about sports in general in the boarding schools, but also raised some interesting points about race and gender ideas. It also had an extensive bibliography that gave me many new sources to look for.


In this book, I found a good deal of information about rebellious feelings among the Indian students. I also learned a little about how the boarding schools changed over time, and was able to draw some conclusions from copies of letters and pages of statistics.


This book proposed an even darker view, posing the boarding schools as a genocide committed by the American government. Though perhaps slightly biased, it was clearly backed up by information and logic.


This was a slightly less specific book containing much general information about the Indian Boarding Schools. There were several pictures, quotes and other primary sources that were also helpful.
This article detailed some of the more complex aspects of the boarding schools. It discussed the varying Native American perspectives on the schools and the different ways they have affected the pan-Indian community today.


This book presented a completely different point of view than any of my other sources. It shows the Boarding Schools as a blessing, a freeing of the Indians. Though highly controversial, it had an interesting point of view, and was able to point out more than a few successes of the schools that had been overlooked in other sources. The author also knew Captain Pratt personally.

Harmon, Alexandra. Email Interview. 11 May 2007.

Alexandra Harmon is an Associate Professor of American Indian Studies at the University of Washington. The most interesting and useful part of this interview was the part where she talked about how, in some ways, the boarding schools deteriorated overtime.

This book had a lot of background information about the state of Indian affairs before the boarding schools came into being. It also had several pictures and quotes that were very helpful.

In the White Man’s Image. Dir. Christine Lesiak. Videocassette. PBS VIDEO, 1991. This video detailed the chronological events of the schools from the arrival of prisoners in Fort Marion to the time when the boarding schools were eventually shut down. Though it is a secondary source, it provided many useful quotes and pictures.

Keohane, Sonja K. “Let all that is Indian within you die!” The Reservation Boarding School System in the U.S., 1870-1928. 26 Mar. 2005. 8 Dec. 2006. http://www.twofrog.com/rezsch.html This website, though a secondary source, showed a strong opinion backed up by numerous facts and sources. It is highly detailed and is easy to understand. I have taken several quotes from it.

Lomawaima, Tsianina K. and Teresa L. McCarty. “To Remain an Indian.” New York: Teachers College Press, 2006. This book deals with the theories and methods that white Americans adopted to create the boarding school education system, and how, today, resurgence effort is being made. It is, essentially, about how to “remain an Indian” in modern times.

This book provided lots of information on the context of the Indian Boarding schools, focusing on westward expansion and violence between the Native Americans and whites.

http://www.english.uiuc.edu/maps/poets/a_f/erdrich/boarding/keyissues.htm

This site was built to offer a source of background information for a poem by Louise Erdrich. It had some useful points and pictures, though somewhat lacking in details. There were several links from the home page that proved to be helpful.

http://www.kporterfield.com/aicttw/articles/boardingschool.html

This website showed some of the more subtle ways the boarding schools took down the Indian youth. It also offered a couple very useful quotes.

http://clarke.cmich.edu/indian/treatyeducation.htm

This site provided a more in depth look at the perspectives of Richard Pratt, the U.S. government, and reformers from that time period. It also gave some very good context and helped me to better understand how the schools had come about.


This book talked about several children who were placed in an Australian boarding school in 1931 by white settlers. It helped me give my topic a more global connection and importance.

Sims, Don. Phone Interview. 11 May 2007.

Mr. Don Sims is the superintendent of Riverside Indian School in Oklahoma, one of the few remaining boarding schools run by the Bureau of Indian Affairs. He spoke a lot to me about how they are doing their part for the resurgence effort by offering classes and clubs centered around remembering the old ways.

Smith, Shannon D. Email Interview. 27 Jan. 2007.

Shannon Smith is a Professor of History at Oglala Lakota College in Pennsylvania, near Carlisle School. She helped give me a better understanding of the boarding schools impacts on modern day.
This book detailed examples of manifest destiny throughout America’s history and was very useful. It was a little hard to understand at parts, but provided some very profound ideas and possible new sources.

This book was helpful in providing background information on westward expansion and the American frontier, and it was slightly useful in helping to place the boarding schools in proper context.

In this book, I found some of the remaining difficulties and hardships that Indians had to deal with long after the boarding schools were terminated. It describes the racial prejudice that outlasted the schools in the United States, specifically Bennett County, South Dakota.
In the late 1870’s, one of the most frequently discussed topics was the disastrous condition of Native American life, commonly called the “Indian Problem.” Assimilation Through Education. The United States has a long-standing tension between preserving the cultural heritage of its diverse population and creating a homogenous culture. Indian populations, however, have been outside such consideration. Indians have weathered conscious attempts to replace their traditional ways with those sanctioned by the U.S. government, such as federal programs removing them from their lands and the destruction of their livelihoods and way of life. To make Indian children patriotic and productive citizens, government-run boarding schools, reservation boarding schools and day schools were introduced. These schools strictly adhered to the speaking of only the English language. See more ideas about Cultural assimilation, Indian boarding schools, Native American history. Richard Henry Pratt, Founder and long-time Superintendent of the Carlisle Indian Industrial School on the United States government cultural assimilation of the surviving American indigenous population. Colour Photography Portfolio Cultural Assimilation Photo Boards Level 3 Human Condition Community College Student Work Your Photos. Top Art Exhibition - Photography » NZQA 2015 Joshua Ropate Kurene, Hagley Community College Board2 It was important for me to address as many vital elements as possible when it came to showcasing the effects of Cultural Assimilation and Adaptation (ie.