

Directors' Duties

Andrew Keay LLB, M Div, LLM, PhD

*Professor of Corporate and Commercial Law
Centre for Business Law and Practice
School of Law
University of Leeds*

*Professorial Research Fellow
Deakin Law School
Deakin University
Melbourne
Barrister, Kings Chambers (Manchester, Leeds and Birmingham)
Legal Practitioner (Aust)*

Published by LexisNexis

LexisNexis
Regus
Terrace Floor
Castlemead
Lower Castle Street
Bristol BS1 3AG

Whilst the publishers and the author have taken every care in preparing the material included in this work, any statements made as to the legal or other implications of particular transactions are made in good faith purely for general guidance and cannot be regarded as a substitute for professional advice. Consequently, no liability can be accepted for loss or expense incurred as a result of relying in particular circumstances on statements made in this work.

© RELX (UK) Limited, trading as LexisNexis 2016

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any way or by any means, including photocopying or recording, without the written permission of the copyright holder, application for which should be addressed to the publisher.

Crown Copyright material is reproduced with kind permission of the Controller of Her Majesty's Stationery Office.

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978 1 78473 221 9

Typeset by Letterpart Limited, Caterham on the Hill, Surrey CR3 5XL

Printed in Great Britain by Hobbs the Printers Limited, Totton, Hampshire SO40 3WX

CONTENTS

Preface to the Third Edition	v
Preface to the Second Edition	vii
Preface to the First Edition	ix
Table of Cases	xxi
Table of Statutes	xlvi
Table of Statutory Instruments	li
Chapter 1	
Introduction	1
Chapter 2	
Directors: Background and Role	9
I Introduction	9
II Types of director	9
A General	9
B Executive and non-executive	10
III Directors recognised at law	12
A De jure directors	13
B De facto directors	13
C Shadow directors	18
D Distinguishing between de facto and shadow directors	23
IV The director's position as a fiduciary	23
V Groups of companies	27
VI Duration of duties	27
Chapter 3	
Directors in the Corporate Governance Process	29
I Introduction	29
II Defining corporate governance	29
III Separation of ownership and control and directorial discipline	31
IV To whom are duties owed?	35
A Shareholder value principle	36
1 From a theoretical viewpoint	36
2 From a positive perspective: What do the cases say?	43
B Stakeholder theory	48
C Summary	55
D Duties to individual shareholders?	56
E Duties to creditors?	56

V Agency theory	57
VI Process	58
VII Recording actions and decisions	59
Chapter 4	
Codification and an Introduction to the General Duties	61
I Introduction	61
II Codification	61
III Interpretation	67
IV Fiduciary duties	70
V Scope and nature of the duties	73
VI Former and shadow directors	75
VII Other duties	77
VIII Proceedings for breach of duties	79
A Who takes proceedings?	79
IX Summary	86
Chapter 5	
Duty to Act within Powers	87
I Introduction	87
II The duty to act in accordance with the company's constitution	88
III The duty to exercise powers for the purposes for which they were conferred	91
A Introduction	91
B Complications	96
C Background	99
D The purpose	105
E The 'but for' test	113
F Focus on the best interests of the company	115
G An assessment	119
IV Summary	126
Chapter 6	
Duty to Promote the Success of the Company	127
I Introduction	127
II The section	129
A Generally	129
B Companies not focused on member benefits	130
C Duties to creditors	130
III The development of the duty	131
A The Company Law Review	131
B Company Law Reform: the first Government White Paper	133
C Company Law Reform: the second Government White Paper	133
D The Company Law Reform Bill	134
IV The interpretation of the section	135
A Introduction	135
B Good faith	139
C Success	152

D 'Benefit members as a whole'	154
E Factors to which regard is to be had	155
1 Long term	161
2 Employees	167
3 Suppliers and customers	169
4 The community and the environment	169
5 High standards of business conduct	172
6 Members	172
7 Summary	173
F 'Have regard to'	174
V What will constitute a breach?	180
VI Enforcement of the duty	183
VII In practice	187
VIII Assessment	192
IX Conclusion	195
Chapter 7	
Duty to Exercise Independent Judgment	197
I Introduction	197
II The existing common law	199
A The general rule	199
B The exceptions	201
III The special case of nominee directors	203
IV The provision – section 173	211
V Conclusion	212
Chapter 8	
Duty of Care, Skill and Diligence	215
I Introduction	215
II Background	220
III The perceived change in judicial approach	225
IV The new provision	228
V Care	232
A Monitoring	234
B Keeping themselves informed	240
C Delegation	242
D Records and accounts	246
E Reliance	250
F The objective standard	255
G Decisions and hindsight	258
H The business judgment rule	261
I Professional advice	266
VI Skill	269
VII Diligence	272
VIII Non-executives	275
IX Enforcement of a breach	278
X Defences	280

XI Concluding remarks	281
A What will the courts consider?	281
B Assessment	282
C Summary	283
Chapter 9	
Avoiding Conflicts of Interest: the Duty	285
I Introduction	285
II Background	287
III The rationale for the avoidance of conflicts	295
IV The section	295
V Conflict of interest	296
VI Possible conflict	297
VII Exceptions	298
VIII Examples of conflict	305
IX Competing directorships	306
X Former directors	312
XI The effects of a conflict	315
XII Opting out	315
XIII Conclusion	316
Chapter 10	
Avoiding a Conflict of Duty: Application	317
I Introduction	317
II Resignation of directors	317
A Introduction	317
B Exploiting opportunities	320
C Establishing a competing business	323
1 Preliminary/preparatory steps	323
2 Other factors	329
III Exploitation	330
A Introduction	330
B Corporate information	331
C Corporate opportunities	332
1 Introduction	332
2 A strict approach	334
3 A more liberal/flexible approach	337
4 Restraint of trade and hindering entrepreneurialism	343
5 Company not being able to exploit the opportunity	345
6 The company would not have succeeded in obtaining the opportunity	346
7 The company chooses not to pursue an opportunity	347
8 Third party preference	348
9 The role in which the director is acting	348
10 The North American experience	352
11 What is an opportunity?	353
12 Directorial conduct	358
IV Conclusion	359

Chapter 11	
Duty not to Accept Benefits	361
I Introduction	361
II The provision	362
III Exceptions	363
IV ‘Third party’	364
V Former directors	364
VI ‘Benefit’	364
VII Secret profits and bribes	365
VIII Authorisation and defence	370
IX Effects	370
Chapter 12	
Duty to Declare an Interest	375
I Introduction	375
II The provision	376
III Exceptions	379
IV An interest	381
V The disclosure	381
A Generally	381
B The manner of disclosure	381
C To whom is disclosure to be made?	382
D Implied disclosure?	383
E Participation of the disclosing director	383
F Disclosure and single directors	383
VI Effects	384
VII Disclosure under section 182	385
Chapter 13	
Duty to Consider the Interests of Creditors	389
I Introduction	389
II Policy and legislative background	390
III The basis of the duty	393
IV The case-law development	395
V The triggering of the duty	400
VI How should directors act?	408
A Generally	408
B When the company is insolvent	413
C When the company is in a pre-insolvency position	419
D Factors to consider	425
VII Is the obligation a duty to creditors?	427
VIII To which creditors is an obligation owed?	430
IX Conclusion	433
Chapter 14	
Derivative Proceedings	435
I Introduction	435
II The common law: some background	439

III The statutory derivative action	442
A Introduction	442
B The elements for gaining permission	443
C The practice and procedure	445
IV The criteria for determining whether permission will be granted	449
A Specified criteria which courts must consider	450
1 Prima facie case	450
2 Elements as to which the court must be satisfied	458
3 Other relevant factors	466
4 Good faith	467
5 Importance to a person acting in accordance with section 172	476
6 Likelihood of authorisation or ratification	477
7 The company has decided not to pursue the claim	479
8 Alternative remedy	479
9 Views of members with no personal interest in the matter	486
B The best interests of the company	488
C Costs	490
V Following permission	494
VI Common law proceedings and retrospective effect	494
VII Companies in liquidation or insolvent	496
VIII Multiple derivative actions	499
IX Foreign derivative claims	502
X Appeals from derivative claim hearings	502
XI The effect of the new procedure	503
XII Conclusion	504
Chapter 15	
Consequences of Breach	507
I Introduction	507
II The relief	508
A Damages or equitable compensation	509
B Account of profits	515
C Restoration of the company's property	519
D Injunction and declaration	520
E Rescission	521
F Money had and received	521
G Dismissal	522
H Proprietary relief	522
I Choice of relief	523
III Constructive trustee	524
IV Allowance to directors	527
V Third parties	529
A Generally	529
B Knowing assistance	533
C Knowing receipt	539
D Relief	543
E Summary	545

Chapter 16	
Authorisation and Ratification of Breaches of Duty	547
I Introduction	547
II Consent, approval or authorisation by the members	549
III Ratification by the members	550
A The essence of, and background to, ratification	550
B Position at common law	553
1 What may be ratified?	553
2 What about unanimous voting?	559
3 Who is bound by ratification?	560
C The section	562
D Ratification of breaches of statutory duties	565
E Sole director/shareholders	565
F Exclusions from voting	566
G A limit on ratification	568
Chapter 17	
Judicial Excusing of Breaches	571
I Introduction	571
II The provision	571
III Background	573
IV Procedure and evidence	574
V Rationale for the provision	575
VI The provision and the duty of care	575
VII The ambit of the provision	579
VIII The conditions	584
A Honesty	585
B Acting reasonably	588
C Fairness	593
IX Apprehended liability	596
X Conclusion	599
Index	601

Directors' duties are a series of statutory, common law and equitable obligations owed primarily by members of the board of directors to the corporation that employs them. It is a central part of corporate law and corporate governance. directors owe duties to the corporation,[1] and not to individual shareholders,[2] employees or creditors outside exceptional circumstances. directors' core duty is to remain loyal to the company, and avoid conflicts of interest.